

MINUTES
GOVERNOR'S MILITARY FACILITIES TASKFORCE
TUESDAY, JUNE 10, 2003, 9:30 A.M. TO 11:30 A.M.
CAPITOL EXECUTIVE TOWER, 2ND FLOOR CONFERENCE ROOM

INTRODUCTION:

Co-Chair Tom Browning (Brigadier General, USAF, Ret.) welcomed the taskforce members and guests to the first meeting. Taskforce members were given an opportunity to introduce themselves individually. The remaining taskforce members include: Co-Chair Bob Johnston (Lieutenant General, USMC, Ret.) of Tucson, Tom Finnegan of Sierra Vista representing Fort Huachuca, Monsignor Richard Richard O'Keeffe of Yuma representing the Marine Corps Air Station and the Army Yuma Proving Grounds, Steve Thu of Tucson representing the National Guard & Reserve units, Lisa Atkins of the West Valley representing Luke Air Force Base, Lori Faeth, the Governor's Natural Resource Policy Advisor, Gil Jimenez of the Arizona Department of Commerce, Gene Santarelli of Tucson representing Davis-Monthan. The taskforce advisors include Patricia Boland from the Attorney General's office and Colonel James Uken representing Luke Air Force Base and the Barry M. Goldwater Range.

With respect to the role of Colonel Uken as a taskforce advisor, co-chair Tom Browning explained the stringent guidance that the Secretary of Defense has released on the limited role that active duty military commanders can play in any efforts that could be construed as BRAC related. Installation commanders can provide facts and information, but they cannot make recommendations or vote on any actions that this taskforce takes up. As much as there will be times that the taskforce would love to hear Colonel Uken's opinion on specific issues, Mr. Browning asked that the taskforce members respect the nature of his role as an advisor only.

OPENING REMARKS BY GOVERNOR NAPOLITANO

Governor Janet Napolitano welcomed the taskforce members and thanked them for agreeing to serve. As the taskforce looks at the BRAC process and how it will impact the State, she stressed the importance of developing the best recommendations for the preservation of all Arizona's military installations and articulating to the Department of Defense why missions should be consolidated into Arizona. She also explained her rationale for the composition of the taskforce where specific skill sets from its representatives were needed to round out the expertise of the taskforce.

Based on the knowledge that the Secretary of Defense wants to close 25% of America's installations by 2005, the Governor emphasized the need to make the case with the Department of Defense that the preservation of Arizona's installations will aid in the defense mission of the United States. Specific issues related to maintaining the missions of each installation will need to be addressed such as encroachment as well as a review of Arizona's laws, statutes, and ordinances may be required. Finally, the Governor requested recommendations from the taskforce on how Arizona can proceed to ensure the long-term viability of its military installations. She closed by asking for "no more surprises".

OPEN MEETING LAW BRIEFING

Patricia Boland, taskforce advisor from the Attorney General's office, briefed the taskforce on the importance of adhering to open meeting law when conducting taskforce meetings. She related this guidance to the fact that since the taskforce was doing the public business that their business

needed to be conducted in public's view. Some of the guidance highlights included 1) a quorum is need to action which equates to a simple majority or at least five taskforce members, 2) taskforce meeting agendas must be published at least 24 hours in advance 3) only items on the agenda can be discussed 4) executive sessions can be closed but should be used for specific matters only 5) minutes must be taken on both open meetings and executive sessions; but these minutes will be kept separate 6) action can only be taken on items on the agenda; any actions taken on items not on the agenda or in violation of open meeting laws will be considered null and void 7) only taskforce members can vote; designees can not vote in the absence of a taskforce member.

CONTEXT OF THE TASK FORCE AND REVIEW OF EXECUTIVE ORDER

Co-Chair Tom Browning explained the mission of the taskforce, the process that the taskforce will follow, the timeline of activities and the role of taskforce members. Created by Executive Order 2003-18 on May 27, the taskforce is comprised of nine voting and two advisory members. The mission of the taskforce is to develop strategies for ensuring the long-term retention of all military facilities in Arizona, so that they may continue to perform their vital National mission. He explained that an understanding of the missions of each one of our installations, the obstacles that they face and the tools available to preserve them will be critical to accomplishing the taskforce's mission.

As part of the process, the taskforce has defined two constituencies that are essential to the identification and resolution of issues relevant to this mission: installation commanders and chief elected officials of areas surrounding Arizona's existing installations. These groupings will be called "advisory groups".

The timeline of activities will involve monthly taskforce meetings open to the public between now and October 31. Based on the timeline driven by BRAC, the taskforce's objective is to complete a draft of recommendations to be circulated to the advisory groups, no later than the October 31. Each member of both advisory groups will have the opportunity to formally comment on taskforce recommendations prior to final presentation to Governor Napolitano. The taskforce plans to deliver a final report to the Governor on December 1, 2003.

Throughout this process, Mr. Browning encourages a continuing dialogue between the taskforce members and their respective communities. The active participation of taskforce members in this effort is critical to the success of this taskforce and the long-term preservation of our military facilities. Finally, he closed by emphasizing that the taskforce must develop recommendations that address the actions required to preserve Arizona's installations, address issues from a statewide perspective and are relevant to the emerging "transformation" of the U.S. Department of Defense. (See special note below to request a copy of presentation slides)

OVERVIEW OF MILITARY INSTALLATIONS

Co-Chair Bob Johnston reviewed the issues facing Arizona's Military Facilities and their importance to the State. He started with the highlights of the BRAC timeline from December 31, 2003 with the release of the draft base selection criteria to November 5, 2005 for the President's presentation of the BRAC closure list to Congress. Then, he stepped through individual operational overviews for each of Arizona's Military Facilities. These facilities included the Marine Corps Air Station Yuma, Army Yuma Proving Ground, Fort Huachuca, Davis Monthan Air Force Base, and Luke Air Force Base. Other units that were mentioned included the Arizona Air National Guard and the Arizona Army National Guard.

From the overview, he used the total economic impact of Arizona's military operations to illustrate their fiscal importance to the State. Arizona's military operations generate a total employment impact (direct, indirect and induced) of 83,506 jobs, over \$5.6 billion in output and over \$233 million in government revenues. From an employment standpoint, the military industry is the leading industry for employment in the State.

To give a broader perspective to the taskforce's activities, Mr. Johnston provided some insight into the Department of Defense (DoD) Quadrennial Defense Review Report published in September 2001. This report is the first signal to the military on how the Secretary of Defense plans to re-shape the DoD. One of the important changes involves a shift in mindset with how the DoD prepares to fight conflicts. They are taking a smarter approach by moving from a threat-based focus (who we might fight i.e. the Soviets, Iraqi, etc) to a capabilities based focus (concerned with how they might fight us). Another shift in mindset crosses the lines of individual branches of military service where 'joint and combined operations are the name of the game with the planning for programs like the Joint National Training Center. Other highlights in this report focus on exploiting intelligence, expanding unmanned vehicle (UAV) programs, and utilization of research and development test centers and ranges. "Faster, Lighter, Smarter"

With this insight into the transformation of the DoD, Mr. Johnston explained how Arizona is poised to contribute to these changes in focus. With the capabilities of Arizona's unique network of multi-service installations and access to several training ranges like the Barry M. Goldwater, the Chocolate Mountain Range (California), Kofa Range and five military operational areas (MOAs): Sells, Gladden/Bagdad, Outlaw/Jackal, Sunny and Tombstone, these are advantages that Arizona has over other states in the US. Mr. Johnston illustrated the point by explaining how every weapon system fired during Iraqi Freedom could be fired on Arizona's ranges. There is not another state that he knew of that could make this claim. Furthermore with the military's increased reliance on "smart bomb" technology (laser & GPS guided missiles), there is an increased need for larger training areas like the ones in Arizona because of the ability to fire weapons from greater standoff distances.

With these great assets to the State and our nation's defense, finding solutions to the issues facing each one of our military facilities like the encroachment on Luke & Davis-Monthan and environmental concerns on Fort Huachuca is critical. In closing, Mr. Johnston asked for assistance from the taskforce members to contribute to his list of the issues facing their respective facilities because from there the taskforce can develop recommendations for solutions. (See special note below to request a copy of presentation slides)

Following this presentation, co-chair Browning talked about how the capabilities of Arizona's unique network of installations create synergies with entities outside of the DoD. The newly formed Department of Homeland Security best makes this case with the expanding need for testing of unmanned vehicles. Arizona's ranges are very well suited for this type of testing.

ECONOMIC IMPACT OF ARIZONA'S PRINCIPAL MILITARY OPERATIONS

Alan Maguire gave a briefing on his study of the economic impact of the Arizona's Principal Military Operations. He began by thanking of the Mayors with military operations in their communities for sponsoring this study. Since this was the first time a study like has ever been done, he explained the methodology and rationale behind the study in areas: key operations, linked military retirees, standardized, uniform data, statewide analysis – all operations and regional analysis – each operation.

Key operations examined were Davis Monthan Air Force Base, Fort Huachuca, Luke Air Force Base, Marine Corps Air Station Yuma, Army Yuma Proving Ground, 161st Air National Guard (Phoenix), 162nd Air National Guard (Tucson), Army National Guard (Papago Park Military Reservation) and Silver Bell Heliport/WAATS. No defense contractors like Boeing in Mesa or Raytheon in Tucson because these operations would not be subjected to federal closure decision.

For the purpose of this study, linked military retirees were military retirees who would potentially leave the State if a military installation within 50 miles or 1 hour of their residence closed. As a result, 25% of military retirees were used as part of this study. In this case and the throughout the study, Mr. Maguire stressed the conservative nature of the interpretation used in the study especially due to the fact that the study was funded by communities with a vested interest in the results.

With the need for standardized, uniform data, Mr. Maguire explained how his team worked closely with installation representatives to ensure that at each installation data was tabulated in a consistent manner. The data from fiscal year 2000 was used.

As an aside, Mr. Maguire revealed a desire to manage the initial message released about the results of this study so that statewide perspective came out first. So, even though, the executive summary of the final report has this statewide focus, the full report has both the statewide analysis and a regional analysis for the specific communities with military operations in them.

Once the data was tabulated and run through their models, the Maguire team was able to quantify the direct, indirect and induced economic impacts for employment and output statewide. Total employment impact, total output and total annual taxes revenues for Arizona's military industry equaled 83,506 jobs, \$5.66 billion, and \$233.6 million, respectively.

Mr. Maguire gave a few examples to put these figures into perspective. The military industry's direct employment figure (41,647 employees) was comparable to four of Arizona's top employers combined: Motorola, Banner, Wal-mart and Honeywell (50,155 employees). The budget of the City of Tempe (\$234 million) is comparable to the military industry's tax revenues.

In the closing, Mr. Maguire emphasized that the stable nature and high pay scale value of the military jobs make them a fundamental part of Arizona's economy. There are the kinds of jobs that are there in good and bad economic times. So, preserving the military industry in Arizona is essential to the long-term fiscal health of the State. (See special note below to request a copy of presentation slides)

BRIEFING ON THE BARRY M. GOLDWATER RANGE

Colonel James Uken, taskforce advisor from Luke Air Force Base and the Barry M. Goldwater Range, gave a briefing on the Barry M. Goldwater Range (BMGR). The mission of the BMGR is to provide superior range operations which enhance the training and testing of assets that protect American interests. Nine DoD bases and the Pacific Fleet utilize the BMGR. Due to the Military Lands Withdrawal Act of 1999, the Air Force (west side) shares administration of the range with the Marine Corps (east side).

On the Air Force side of the range, there are 1.7 million acres of restricted airspace with four manned ranges, three tactical ranges, and five live ordnance ranges. These areas are ideal for this

type of training because there is no mining, no grazing, no agriculture, no residential and no air routes for commercial traffic.

On the Marine Corps side, there are 2.8 million acres of restricted airspace with three ranges. The ranges offer unique training with an air-to-air range, an electronic combat range and urban close air support target sets. This side of the BMGR encompasses 60% of all Marine Corps training areas.

The strategic importance of the BMGR is its link to its users: Luke AFB (only active duty US Air Force F-16 training unit), Davis-Monthan (only A-10 training unit), Tucson (largest Air National Guard F-16 training unit) and 100% of all Marine Corps pilots. 50% of F-16 aircrews and 100% of F-15E and A-10 aircrews in the Persian Gulf War trained on the BMGR. Even with all this activity, 94% of the range remains in pristine desert condition. Colonel Uken explained the strong working relationship that he and his Marine Corps counterpart maintain with local, state and federal agencies with invested interests in the proper management of the range.

Another area that falls under BMGR management is the Gila Bend Air Force Auxiliary Field. This area is used for A-10 Night Vision Goggle landing practice in preparation for deployments, Army and Marine Corps helicopter staging and US Air Force Academy parachute team activities.

In closing, Colonel Uken offered to provide information to the taskforce as needed. (See special note below to request a copy of presentation slides)

CALL TO THE PUBLIC:

Co-Chair Tom Browning made a call to the public.

NEXT MEETING:

The next Governor's Military Facilities Taskforce meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, July 8th, from 9:30am to 12:30am at the Central Arizona Community College in Coolidge, AZ.

Special Note: Electronic copies of the presentations noted above are available on request. Please contact Dion Flynn at (602) 542-7007 or send an email to dflynn@az.gov.